

PROOF

11

Localizing Collective Memory: Radio Broadcasts and the Construction of Regional Memory

*Motti Neiger, Eyal Zandberg, and Oren Meyers**

This study, which focuses on the interrelations between media, memory, and collectives, examines the significant role played by the media in forming the two dimensions of collective mediated recollections: shaping the memory and defining the boundaries of the collective. One of the central arguments raised in recent years in the field of social science maintains that more attention should be shifted to the ‘cosmopolitan turn’ (Beck, 2003; Beck and Sznaider, 2006), the process that involves more openness to the transnational arena and the sensitivity to ‘universal values’ that become part of national societies. Within this context, we argue that although most of the research devoted to collective memory centers on the construction of national memory – in the era of globalization, collective memory and commemoration that exist in a cosmopolitan context (Levy and Sznaider, 2006) – it does not necessarily promote national values. We will contend that, parallel to the ‘cosmopolitan turn’, a reverse process might be identified whereby small communities – the relations among whose members rely on geographical or ideological vicinity, or yet on common areas of interest – succeed in creating regional-communal-local versions of the collective national memory.¹

According to the underlying view of this chapter, memory and patterns of commemoration ought to be examined from a multilayered perspective; thus, whereas the cosmopolitan aspects of memory are explored at the global level and the national elements of memory are examined in the context of specific nations, the local aspects of memory should be studied at a regional level. These three layers emphasize the complexity and flexibility of the concept of ‘collective memory’.

Throughout this chapter, we shall see how changes in the media – in our case, the establishment of regional radio stations in Israel during

the mid-1990s – facilitate changes in the memory-shaping processes by constructing local communities as ‘regional mnemonic collectives’. The regional memory level may well have existed before the advent of regional media, but its introduction makes it more evident and therefore easier for us, researchers, to identify and characterize.

The regional memory version sometimes resembles the national one, yet it retains idiosyncratic characteristics; sometimes it is different from the national memory and even tends to undermine it. We shall furthermore argue that in an era of new media, in which the concept of community is rapidly changing, it can be expected that, in the future, the notion of ‘collective’ to which we relate and which we construct by means of public recollection, will be further challenged. In this era, the mediated memory of regional communities constitutes another focal point of recollection, working alongside the national memory or underneath it. The national memory, in turn, will need to confront both supranational and communal-regional versions. In other words, this chapter also proposes a line of thought in the opposite direction, namely, the construction of not only regional memory but also regional identity, i.e. regional (imagined) communities endeavor to construct their own identity by the different ways in which they address and reinterpret ‘larger’ memories. Hence, for instance the construction process analyzed in this chapter regards an event that is not directly linked to the region, to the ‘small place’, that memorializes it; rather, in our case study the momentous, traumatic event happened sometime else and somewhere far away. This is unlike the recollection of ‘small’ events that happened at the place and thus, in a sense ‘belong’ to that place, and unlike the specific way ‘great’ events that occurred at the small place are commemorated there (e.g. the Battle of Gettysburg as memorialized by the people of Gettysburg). In our test case, however, and through the prism of the media, we are already directing to an imagined community, which while smaller than the national community is still an imagined one, with regional radio acting as a bonding instrument among its denizens.

In order to demonstrate our argument we focus on the broadcasting of regional radio stations during Israel’s Memorial Day for the Holocaust and Heroism (hereafter: MDHH). The regional radio stations were established in the mid-1990s; until then, national public radio stations enjoyed a monopoly over electronic mass communication. This situation facilitates the understanding of the role played by regional radio stations in the development of regional memory, in comparison with the collective national memory that is so central to Israeli culture.

Regional radio stations make an excellent test case because national public media characterize the map of electronic media in Israel. Since the decline of party-sponsored newspapers, the printed media in Israel is dominated by national newspapers; in addition, most of the regional newspapers – which appear only on weekends – are owned by the publishers of the national newspapers. Furthermore, cable TV stations in Israel began operating in 1990 as regional stations but in 2003 all the regional cable TV stations became merged under the common HOT brand, and so cable television broadcasting lost its original, regional character, so that there are, in practice, no local-regional television stations. Therefore, regional radio stations remain the sole mass media operating on an everyday basis addressing regional-local-communal audiences.

This angle is worth attention no less than the collective memory studies, which are habitually limelighted. As posited by Kitch:

Most studies of mediated memory have focused on elite-news-media coverage of extreme events ... but like local newspapers and television news, magazines are worth attention because of their overt points of view, their audiences' long-term devotion to them, and their open identification with those audiences. In both of these types of media, journalists use an inclusive language and address their readers or viewers as members of a social group with common values, with similar problems and needs, and with a shared understanding of its past. (Kitch, 2008, 312–13)

In this chapter, we will focus on three regional radio stations: Radio Tel Aviv, Radio Jerusalem, and Radio Kol-Rega (the latter broadcasting in Northern Israel), and will analyze their programs on MDHH between the years 2004 and 2007. The study centers on an analysis of the repertoire of songs featured on these stations in the course of the MDHH, on talk programs, and on texts spoken by the presenters of the stations. The limited scope of this chapter does not allow for a wide-ranging elaboration on the concept of 'collective memory' and the evolution of discussions of the subject (see authors' introduction to this volume for an elaborated review). Nevertheless, before presenting the analysis dealing with the shaping of 'regional memory' of the Holocaust, we wish to anchor our analysis within several specific contexts: recent developments in the commemoration of the Holocaust in Israel, the place of regional radio within the map of Israeli media, and the legal context of regional radio broadcasts on MDHH.

The evolution of Holocaust remembrance in Israel during the 1990s

The remembrance and commemoration of the Holocaust play a central role in the shaping of Israeli civil religion (Liebman and Don-Yehiya, 1983). National-Zionist ideology frames the memory of the Holocaust through a reliance on the formula 'from Holocaust to Resurgence'. It represents the Holocaust, in many aspects, as the inevitable nadir point of Jewish existence in exile, and as an absolute justification for the existence of the State of Israel (Ofer, 1996; Segev, 1993; Zandberg, 2008; Zerubavel, 1996).

The investigation of Israeli Holocaust memory from the 1990s and thereafter is characterized by two main trends, which correspond to changes in the world and in Israeli society. One of these trends is the increasing emphasis placed by Israeli culture on the representation of the Holocaust. Therefore, the investigation of collective Holocaust memory has begun to deal with not only with politics and history, but also with television (Shandler, 1999; Zandberg, 2006; Meyers, Zandberg, and Neiger, 2009), cinema (Loshitzky, 1997), the press (Neiger, 1999; Zandberg, 2010), and popular music (Meyers and Zandberg, 2002; Neiger, Meyers, and Zandberg, forthcoming, 2011). The second trend is the growing research focus on the public discourse, viewed from a reflective standpoint, which explores the place of memory and post-memory in Israeli society and culture. Zuckerman (1993) studied the 'Holocaust discourse' that arose during the first Gulf War (1991), Ben-Amos and Bat-El (1999) explored the MDHH ceremonies in schools, and Romi and Lev (2007) analyzed the impact of memorial journeys to Poland on Israeli youths. Another trend, which began back in the 1980s, is the emergence of representatives of the 'second generation' and 'third generation' (children and grandchildren of Holocaust survivors) as prevailing factors in shaping Holocaust memory in the public arena. Since then, the focus of Israeli memorializing discourse has shifted from the presentation of Holocaust chronologies, to a reflexive discussion of Holocaust representations as cultural and political phenomena, while illuminating the constructive dimension of collective memory shaping (Holtzman, 1992; Zandberg, 2008).

Radio and the forging of the national community

Katz and Wedell (1977), who studied the role of radio in new nation-states, contend that the new regimes in these states made extensive use of the medium, after they realized its efficacy in conveying messages

between the authorities and the citizens, and in imparting educational and national contents. In this context, radio proved superior to television (which was costly to produce and expensive to buy) and to written journalism (whose consumption necessitates literacy).

In Israel, radio played a decisive role in establishing and consolidating the nation during the first decades after the creation of the State (Pansler, 2004). The exclusive position enjoyed by radio in the field of electronic broadcasting during the crucial first twenty years of Israel's existence since 1948, when the press was politically divided and television was absent – Israel's first television channel started broadcasting in 1968 – gave it much weight in setting the collective agenda. In the specific context of MDHH broadcasts, it is important to point out that, besides the prohibition of commercials, state laws governing the Rules of Observance of Memorial Day decree that these shall include the following elements:

On Memorial Day, two minutes of silence will be observed nationwide. All manner of work and transportation must cease to operate during that period of time. Memorial services, public gatherings and ceremonies will take place in military bases and educational institutions ... *Programs aired on the radio will express the uniqueness of the day* [authors' emphasis]; entertainment venues will feature only appropriate contents. (MDHH Law, 1959)

Hence, the state itself ascribes radio, as a national instrument, an importance commensurate with such rituals as flying the national flag at half-mast and congregating popular meetings at schools and military camps. Since the advent of fourteen regional-commercial radio stations in the 1990s that began broadcasting parallel to the existing nationwide public networks, regional radio programming focuses on regional or sectoral actualities, serves and fashions specific cultural tastes, and enables the establishment and shaping of 'socio-geographical' regional and sectoral identities within Israeli society. In the words of Liebes, 'the radio is perhaps the most dramatic accelerator of the unity at the stage of establishment as well as at the stage of society splitting into differentiated groups (1999: 97).

The idiosyncratic nuances of regional radio broadcasting on MDHH

Before the advent of regional radio stations in the 1990s and even concurrently with their appearance on the electronic mass communication scene, public radio in Israel operated according to almost uniform patterns. One of the salient characteristics of public national radio MDHH

broadcasts is the intensive airing of soft, minor, and melancholic Hebrew songs. Such songs, dubbed in the popular parlance 'Holocaust Day songs', are relatively old Israeli songs dating from the 1970s and even earlier, and they symbolize a nostalgic and sentimental imagination of the common past. Interspersed with the songs, short explanatory texts and traffic or news reports were sometimes aired by station anchors, and in many cases, the radio just aired song after song without any interruption or intervention. An analysis of almost 17,000 songs aired on national and regional radio during the 1990s reveals a stable repertoire of songs frequently aired by all stations throughout the years. These include many songs whose lyrics are taken from Hebrew poetry, and songs written by Holocaust victims or those that were written and performed by second-generation composers and singers; however, most of these songs patently *do not deal with the Holocaust in itself*. These are mostly lyrical, quiet songs, which speak about the human condition in the world, and may be read as 'secular prayers'.

The regional radio stations, on the other hand, challenge the way that public radio deals with the national mourning ritual and offer a version of their own.

In the following sections we will examine examples of the way MDHH programming is framed by three different radio stations; two of these, Radio Jerusalem and Radio Tel Aviv, operate in Israel's two largest cities and articulate the tensions between the different identities that each of these cities expresses. The third station, Radio Kol-Rega, broadcasts from the more peripheral Galilee region, in Northern Israel. For the purposes of this investigation, we reviewed the songs aired during MDHH (see also Kaplan, 2009; Neiger, Meyers, and Zandberg, forthcoming, 2011).

We referred to the programs of the national radio stations as a point of reference, against which to assess the extent to which the regional radio stations are associated with or detached from the way memory is framed by national public media. These examples express diverse approaches to the national broadcasts: construction of regional patterns of commemoration parallel to the national model; a challenging of the national forms of commemoration; and construction of a narrative similar to the national narrative with some regional nuances.

Radio Jerusalem: emulating national patterns of commemoration while adding local hues

Jerusalem is the capital of Israel and the site and center of its government, but from the point of view of Israeli media, the center is Tel Aviv, which is considered the secular business and cultural center in general, and the heart of Israeli media in particular. The most important newspapers,

commercial television stations, the Stock Exchange and the largest economic concerns, the main theaters, the Opera House and most other places of amusement, are all based in the Tel Aviv metropolitan area.

As on other important memorial days and festivities of the Jewish-Israeli civil religion, on MDHH Jerusalem becomes the center from which legal and ethical authority emanates, governing the nature of the observance. State commemorative ceremonies take place in Jerusalem and on these days, all eyes are turned toward this city. Yad Vashem, the Holocaust Martyrs' and Heroes' Remembrance Museum, is located in Jerusalem, and the wreath-laying ceremony is held there. Following this ritual, the Israeli Parliament holds the 'Unto Every Person There is a Name' ceremony, during which names of Holocaust victims are read aloud. All of this means that, on MDHH, Jerusalem's institutional authority is amplified, and all its 'local news' echoes as 'national news'.

The public radio and television networks are also based in Jerusalem. During the decades when they were the sole broadcasting stations in Israel, these channels established the collective patterns of commemoration. As mentioned, the prohibition of the airing of commercials on MDHH neutralizes the economic dimension of commercial broadcasting; and so on MDHH, commercial media emulates, in many respects, the programming patterns of public networks (Meyers, Neiger, and Zandberg, 2009).

In recent decades, the tension between Jerusalem and Tel Aviv as agents of the two dimensions of Jewish-Israeli identity have become more focalized. While Jerusalem has asserted its place as the capital of the Jewish People (which assigns much importance to the religious dimension and is generally seen as having a conservative and right-wing outlook), Tel Aviv is identified with the universalist, secular-liberal facet of Israeli culture (Vinitzki-Seroussi, 1998). To what extent is this claim borne out by MDHH broadcasts on regional-local radio stations? It would seem that Radio Jerusalem positions itself as the closest follower of the mainstream and continues the broadcasting patterns established by national radio stations – with regard to the music and texts, the tone of its programs, and the personages that populate its MDHH broadcasts. As to the kind of verbal texts that accompany the songs, this station emulates the national public news network, Reshet Bet, as it continues to observe the secular daily ritual of reading the newspapers during its morning programs. The following is an excerpt from *Radio Jerusalem's* 2007 MDHH morning program:

The time is 9:22 a.m. and here are the headlines ... [The newspaper] *Ma'ariv* brings this distressing information: 130 Holocaust survivors

die each day; Memorial Day 2007, witnesses of the atrocities are passing away, while anti-Semitic incidents in the world become ever more frequent ... The paratroopers in a letter to the Prime Minister: 'You have forsaken the captive soldiers'; reserve service soldiers are on the offensive. Still in *Ma'ariv*, about the law that is likely to contribute to corruption in government contracts: contracts worth less than two million shekels will be exempt from the obligation of competitive tendering. History returns to Masada: after forty years, hundreds of ancient archeological findings were returned to the site. New drivers: the revolution of driving licenses in Israel.

The plan: motorists having passed the drivers' test will have to undergo a six-month trial period before they are issued a permanent driving license. The author of the best-seller 'Kennedy' reveals the secrets of the Mossad; according to the author, he served as a covert agent for the Israeli intelligence services and carried out missions in Syria and Iran. Also about the vanishing hum: the connection between cellular phones and the disappearance of honey bees ...

Many of Israel's radio stations habitually read aloud the headlines of the morning newspapers, and Radio Jerusalem continues this daily ritual, as does the national public radio Reshet Bet. However, at the same time, many of the news items that populate this segment of the broadcasts on this specific day deal with MDHH events or the fate of Holocaust survivors (Zandberg, Neiger, and Meyers, 2010). The trend of espousing established modes of commemoration also finds expression in the predominance of quotations from state leaders and figures of prominent public and biographical standing. This includes the President of the State; the Prime Minister; dignitaries who are also Holocaust survivors, such as (former) Chief Rabbi Israel Lau; and representatives of survivors' and voluntary organizations that assist survivors (e.g. 'Amcha').

Continuing this trend, Radio Jerusalem chooses to broadcast the national commemoration ceremony live from Yad Vashem. This ceremony is aired by all three national television channels and by the national public radio networks. By putting this ceremony on the air, Radio Jerusalem emphasizes that it continues the commemoration and programming patterns shaped by the national broadcasting channels. Unlike other radio stations that present their own version of the commemorative ritual, Radio Jerusalem affiliates itself with the Israeli establishment.

The characteristic feature of the music aired by Radio Jerusalem on MDHH is its manifest similarity with the music aired by public

radio stations. Of the three regional radio stations examined, the playlist featured on Radio Jerusalem is the one that most resembles that of the national radio stations. The playlist includes songs such as 'A Walk to Caesarea', 'Angel Tears', 'For the Man is the Tree of the Field', songs by Yehuda Poliker presented by the announcer saying, 'Yehuda Poliker, from *Ashes and Dust*, an album entirely dedicated to his parents, who are Holocaust survivors', and songs by mainstream Israeli singers. Interestingly enough, some of the songs are particularly identified with Israel's Memorial Day for the Fallen Soldiers, which the nation observes a week after MDHH. Overall, we can see that along with the traditional musical repertoire of the national radio, which is based on old-time songs, Radio Jerusalem adds a number of new songs, albeit remaining within the quiet and melancholic music style; these, however, are lyrical love songs that do not deal with the Holocaust or with bereavement.

Radio Tel Aviv: challenging national commemoration patterns

The choices of Radio Tel Aviv single it out among the other radio stations (both national and regional) and, in fact, differentiate it to the point that it becomes, in some sense, an alternative, oppositional or even avant-garde type of radio vis-à-vis the dominant voice in MDHH broadcasts. For example, on 2004 MDHH eve (in line with Jewish tradition, MDHH commences on the eve of MDHH and ends on the following evening) the station aired only quiet music, while the other regional radio stations aired the newscast at 7 p.m., and from 8 to 9 p.m. they aired the MDHH ceremony live from Yad Vashem. At this very significant point, Radio Tel Aviv set itself apart and did not join in the national broadcasting mourning ritual.

As mentioned, while the ceremony was aired on other stations Radio Tel Aviv chose to air quiet music. Every hour, the announcers explained in a single-sentence, ritualistic speech, the significance of the change in their habitual programming: 'It is the eve of MDHH; we will [now] listen to an hour of quiet music.'

The nonconforming character of Radio Tel Aviv broadcasts expresses itself also in the station's MDHH music playlists. While the other radio stations choose to air soft, traditional Hebrew songs, Radio Tel Aviv also airs non-Hebrew music along with relatively up-to-date Hebrew songs. These are not rhythmic rock or pop songs, and they are characterized by a quiet, lyrical tone; yet the list of singers and songwriters also includes some of the most currently popular performers of Western music such as Coldplay, Robbie Williams, The Cardigans, George Michael, and Sting.

Thus, the preferences of Radio Tel Aviv point to a different type of collective memory; the main feature of Radio Tel Aviv programming signifying its observance of the mourning ritual which constructs 'holy time' is the station's calm and minor tone. As mentioned, this is not, however, an exclusively Israeli quiet tone, but rather a more universal one. Tel Aviv is the most cosmopolitan city in Israel, and this fact is echoed on MDHH as well. To paraphrase Ann Swidler's 'toolkit' conceptualization of culture, it can be said that Radio Tel Aviv quite deliberately offers a toolkit completely different from the one proffered by other Israeli radio stations. The contention of Radio Tel Aviv is that 'it can be done otherwise' (or even, maybe, 'it should be done otherwise'), and that its audience needs a different soundtrack in order to bestow meaning upon the mourning ritual.

In so doing, Radio Tel Aviv pours new contents into the existing ritual and offers a transgressive substitute to MDHH as it exists on the other radio stations and as it was before the advent of Radio Tel Aviv. Critics of this approach may argue that by detaching itself from the conventional norms of observing the national bereavement ritual Radio Tel Aviv exemplifies an outward-looking stance rather than the widely shared national inward-looking point of view. Even more grievously, they may assert that this trend means an abandoning of the national mourning tradition (even though respecting the letter of the law) while emphasizing continuity of routine broadcasts.

This argument can be taken even further. By customarily featuring non-Hebrew contemporary music (even though quiet) and refraining from addressing the Holocaust itself, these broadcasts of Radio Tel Aviv might be said to cancel the special content character of the commemoration. What is left is merely 'shape devoid of content', and this detachment between shape and content leads to Radio Tel Aviv broadcasts expressing a kind of general melancholy disconnected from the memory of the Holocaust.

At the same time, it may be argued that, because the listeners are members of Israeli culture and are aware that this is MDHH (from other indications, such as the sounding of the siren), they do not need another resonating reminder in the form of songs directly identified with Holocaust commemoration, just its recognizable tone. The very essence of regional radio is creating cultural pluralism and providing different sectors with a means of expression. Within this context, Radio Tel Aviv indeed reflects a specific sector: young people living in central Israel, who wish to connect to the mourning ritual in their own way and get a 'memory menu' reflecting a style of their own.

As mentioned, Tel Aviv is the cultural and business center of Israel; yet on remembrance days, the status of Jerusalem as a 'center' challenges Tel

Aviv's assumed supremacy. On days such as MDHH Jerusalem produces and disseminates the information, values, and accepted rules that define the mourning ritual. Still, if we re-examine the definition of 'periphery' according to conventional models, Tel Aviv cannot be labeled as such, even though on remembrance days it stops functioning as the 'center'. On those days, Tel Aviv does not dictate the dominant values and norms, but it is far from being 'peripheral' because it does not accept the values of the 'center'. A more appropriate way to label Radio Tel Aviv broadcasts on MDHH is to use definitions such as 'independent' or even 'avant-garde', which challenge the mainstream center and propose a different cultural toolkit. In other words, these findings support the view that concepts such as 'center' and 'periphery' are not static but rather dynamic and defined through ongoing cultural negotiation.

Finally, a testimony to the complexity of the decision to air only Hebrew songs on MDHH can be found in the choice of songs aired in the last year examined for this study. On MDHH 2007, Radio Tel Aviv featured only Hebrew songs. Possibly, this change is related to the fact that in 2007, Radio Tel Aviv changed hands, and the new owners have a rather conservative outlook that clearly opposes the purportedly 'elitist approach' that characterized this station until then. As Shimon Elkabetz, the manager of the station in the years 2007–2010 declared, 'you can't broadcast to the State of Tel-Aviv', reflecting the popular notion that Tel Aviv is a state within a state (Shalita, 2010) that serves only a small highbrow segment of Israel's population.

Radio Kol-Rega (Northern Israel): a regional version of national modes of commemoration

Radio Kol-Rega is geographically far away from central Israel and is supposed to represent the voice of the people of the northern region of the country, the Galilee. Relative remoteness from the center, a more limited budgetary allocation for development, and lack of political, cultural, and economic influence have shaped this region as 'peripheral'. Therefore, unlike the preceding two radio stations, which compete over the shaping of the values of central Israel, the question we will ask here is to what extent geographical remoteness also means cultural isolation. This underlying question was also addressed by Haim Hecht, the manager of Radio Kol-Rega and one of its owners who writes for the station website: 'This station was modeled in the shape of the region covered by its license.' Therefore, in our analysis we claim that Radio Kol-Rega offers a regional adaptation of national commemoration patterns.

The exploration of the repertoire of songs aired on Radio Kol-Rega during MDHH shows a mix of many singers located at the top of the playlists of the national networks, alongside a number of artists whose songs are very seldom heard on the national public networks. The most salient diversions from the national repertoire could be found in the inclusion of Middle Eastern pop songs ('Mizrahi music', see Regev and Seroussi, 2004) in the playlists. On MDHH, Radio Kol-Rega offers musical compositions ranging from veteran songs from the 1970s and 1980s (performed mostly by singers of Ashkenazi-Western origin), to current Mizrahi music performed by younger singers. Many of the songs are love songs and some even challenge the minor tone set in the center.

One of the explanations for this musical choice can be found in the outlook of the manager of the station Haim Hecht, a second-generation Holocaust survivor, who considers the Holocaust a central theme in Israeli culture and his own biography:

I grew up in Holon [a city near Tel Aviv]. The atmosphere was that of the *shtetl* [a typically small town with a Jewish population in pre-Holocaust Central and Eastern Europe], something that was copied from Lodz; a father whose entire family was wiped out in the [concentration] camps and who never opened his mouth, and a mother who never shut hers; an uncle who had been in Auschwitz and never stopped telling stories. I heard these stories hundreds of times ... My Zionism stems from the belief that we must fight for this 60-year-old country. The Holocaust is the most important and concrete ideological foundation of my Zionism. On the [Israel's] Memorial Day for the Fallen Soldiers, we focus on the battles that took place in this region. On the Holocaust Day, I have no such geographic connection, but I will indeed present Holocaust survivors living in the area. Their accounts create a link between the Holocaust and the region ... Most of the media handles the Holocaust as something broadcasters must do even though they do not really believe in it; they feel that they have no choice regarding the Holocaust Day and act unwillingly, or due to extreme regulatory pressure. (Interview with Hecht, July 15, 2008)

Thus, Hecht identifies himself as a firm believer in the idea that the Holocaust must be treated as a central theme and must be given wide and dominant expression. This is perhaps the reason why Radio Kol-Rega styled and produced special MDHH jingles, which repeatedly reminded

the listeners 'Memorial Day for the Holocaust and the Heroism – remember and never forget!'

In keeping with the views of the station manager, one of the salient characteristics of Radio Kol-Rega MDHH broadcasts are the testimonies of Holocaust survivors, interspersed with songs. On the one hand, the station includes testimonies of Holocaust survivors residing in the region (and not representatives of the political establishment, as is the case on Radio Jerusalem); on the other hand, however, these testimonies are fashioned to fit the Israeli commemorative meta-narrative and to support and sustain Zionist ideology. By their very nature, these testimonies are perceived as particularly trustworthy: the witnesses were 'there and then' (i.e. in Europe during the war) and they tell the story of their individual lives in the first person. They are also 'here and now'; they now live in the region and so their personal stories are intertwined with the national narrative.

The following are two short examples of these types of testimonies, aired between the songs:

My name is Dorka Sternberg, and I have been a member of Kibbutz Lohamei Haghetaot [lit. Ghettos' fighters] for fifty-four years. I arrived in Israel on March 20 [1949] and went directly to Lohamei Haghetaot. For the last twenty years, I have worked at the educational center affiliated with 'Beit Lohamei Haghetaot' museum.

I am Franka Kant and I have been a member of Kibbutz Beit Zera for more than fifty years. I was born in Poland. I believe I am the only survivor of my entire family, all of the others are gone: my parents, a brother, uncles, cousins and their children, so many children ... Families were large, extended, with many branches. The entire family disappeared, only I and another brother, who lived here, were left.

I arrived in this country after the war, which lasted five years. I came here, married, and joined the Kibbutz ... We built it from zero, from nothing, and, though I am old now, I pledge that my duty in life, besides building my family and the country, is to remember and never forget. First and foremost, every child of a nation must know what happened to their people: where it came from, what came to pass upon them there, what their past was – so they will know what their roots are; first of all [you must] learn where you come from, and then you can know where you are going.

Besides the monologues of Holocaust survivors residing in the region, during the day the broadcasters repeat set phrases such as 'To remember

and never forget. We memorialize those who were exterminated, and support, embrace and love the survivors.' This reference to the survivors is uncharacteristic (certainly in comparison with other stations) and interesting because it is typified by the adoption of emotional-communal rhetoric. Geographically, Radio Kol-Rega is the most peripheral among the radio stations examined in this study, and this 'neighbor-embracing' rhetoric can be considered a sign of the communality that the station endeavors to convey to its listeners. In other words, the station chooses to center on the people living in the region in which it broadcasts and on the 'here and now' of its audience.

As previously mentioned, the testimonies of Holocaust survivors aired by Radio Kol-Rega during MDHH correspond with the national meta-narrative often summarized in the phrase 'from Holocaust to resurgence'. Coinciding with this national narrative and with survivor testimonies, the texts spoken by the broadcasters of the station emphasize the importance of the existence of the State of Israel, as one of the lessons that ought to be learned from the Holocaust. Let us consider, for example, the following excerpt from one of Radio Kol-Rega's programs on MDHH 2006:

The remembrance day that annually marks Holocaust and Heroism is an event that speaks to the communing soul in two voices: on the one hand the grief, wrath, and despair of the survivors and their children; on the other hand, the revival, the determination, the tenacious holding onto the trunk of life, of memory. We are commanded 'to remember and never forget': to remember those who fought and those who were massacred; those who believed and those who lost their faith; the blessed ones who had the good fortune of seeing the light again, and the ones for whom a malignant darkness will be their eternal companion. Let us comfort the low-spirited and be proud of the upstanding. One and all are engraved onto our lives, onto our landscapes, on the history and the legacy of their generation, as well as on the discourse, which every year complements the Memorial Day for the Holocaust and Heroism. As every year, today again we remember them, the mosaic that makes up the impalpable experience called the genocide of our people. I am Ami Kabri, enjoy listening!

This quasi-homily is a striking example of the texts that accompany the songs. On the one hand, the presenter made a point of stressing the uniqueness of the Holocaust and its commemoration several times, and, therefore, the exceptional character of the day's programming; on the

other hand, he was unable to depart from the broadcasting habit and ended with the commonplace exhortation, 'Enjoy listening!'

The power fields of memory: national, cosmopolitan, and regional

As demonstrated throughout this chapter, each of the three radio stations we examined proposes its own version of representation of the Holocaust in national memory. They do not reject the modes of representation on the more traditional national level, but rather offer three different approaches: Radio Jerusalem follows the conventional forms of commemoration and stresses its adherence to the political establishment on this day, while adding local tones; Radio Tel Aviv offers an alternative to the conventional national forms of commemoration; and Radio Kol-Rega proffers a communal variety of the national memorializing patterns. It is important to point out that, overall, the three stations embrace the salient characteristics of the national format (predominance of minor tone Hebrew songs), to which they add other components. Therefore, regional memory does not void the national one, but rather constitutes an additional stratum: the regional radio stations maintain a dialogue with the features of national commemoration, which are shaped by the established national public media.

The relationships between the different modes of commemoration allow us to depict the relations between the cultural and ideological center and the periphery: Radio Jerusalem positions itself at the heart of the Zionist-Jewish-Israel center; Radio Tel Aviv offers an alternative that challenges the conventional-national form of commemoration, which echoes the secular center of the state. Radio Kol-Rega shapes itself as an Israeli-peripheral voice; the emphasis on testimonies of locally residing survivors and the consolidation of a distinctive soundtrack (Middle Eastern music) sets this station well within the national frame, yet in a definitively peripheral position.

Another way to illustrate the relationship between the stations and the Israeli center/periphery model is to look at the tension between ritual and routine. Radio Jerusalem presents the most distinctive disparity between its broadcasts during MDHH and routine broadcasts; it follows the establishment in moving sharply from the mundane routine into the sacred ritual. Radio Tel Aviv does not make such a clear distinction between ritual and routine broadcasts, and Radio Kol-Rega is closer in its programming to that of Radio Jerusalem, and to society's mainstream.

This research also underscores the central position of the media in establishing and shaping collective memory. The media plays a key role in both consolidating and defining the boundaries of the collective. As mentioned, the regional radio stations are an exceptional case, because they are the sole regional electronic mass communication media in Israel. In the absence of regional television stations, or strong and dominant independent local newspapers, these radio stations constitute the sole voice expressing specific regions and sectors of the population. Before the advent of the regional radio stations, it was not possible to discern separate modes of media commemorations of the Holocaust for the regions of Jerusalem, Tel Aviv, and the Galilee. Therefore, this chapter demonstrates the process whereby mass communication media can establish and shape regional memory.

We feel bound to qualify this assertion, however, by stating that we should take into account that the media is not the sole channel that creates the regional-communal memory, but rather it serves as the means allowing memory researchers to identify such a memory existence even in the absence of mass media. In order to isolate the singular role played by the media in this process, it would be necessary to analyze the different forms of collective memory (local commemoration ceremonies, regional museums, commemoration programs initiated by educational institutions, etc.).

Such an examination might dwell upon the questions of whether, and to what extent, these relations are bi-directional, that is, whether these are only bottom-top relations, from the regional to the cosmopolitan level via the national one, or whether they work in the opposite direction as well: the regional level influencing the shaping of the national and even the cosmopolitan levels. One of the characteristics of the global era is the acknowledgment of small communities and narratives alongside the cosmopolitan ones. In other words, despite the common denominator in shaping memory, in the era of new media and saturated media environment, memory is also shaped by small groups, which, via the media, can interact on a 'common memory ground' or memory sphere, whether it is a geographical area or a cyber-space.

Notes

*This research was supported by the Israel Science Foundation (Grant no. 291/07). The research project explored different aspects and modes of MDHH commemoration on Israeli radio and television (Meyers, Neiger, and Zandberg, 2011; Neiger, Meyers, and Zandberg, 2011).

1. Ulrich Beck (2003) pointed at the connections and conflicts between 'cosmos' and 'polis' (city/state), 'cosmos', and the multilayered identity that emerges in a new cosmopolitan era.

References

- Beck, U. (2003). 'Rooted Cosmopolitanism: Emerging from a Rivalry of Distinctions'. In Ulrich Beck, Natan Sznaider, and Rainer Winter (eds.), *Global America? The Cultural Consequences of Globalization*. Liverpool: Liverpool University Press, 15–29.
- Beck U. and Sznaider, N. (2006). 'Unpacking Cosmopolitanism for the Social Sciences: a Research Agenda', *British Journal of Sociology* 57 (1): 1–23.
- Ben-Amos, A. and Bet-El, I. (1999). 'Holocaust Day and Memorial Day in Israeli Schools: Ceremonies, Education and History', *Israel Studies* 4 (1): 258–84.
- Holtzman, A. (1992). 'Trends in the Israeli Holocaust Fiction in the 80s', *Modern Hebrew Literature* 8–9: 23–8.
- Kaplan, D. (2009). 'The Songs of the Siren: Engineering National Time on Israeli Radio', *Cultural Anthropology* 24 (2): 313–45.
- Katz, E. and Wedell, G. (1977). *Broadcasting in the Third World*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- Kitch, C. (2008). 'Placing Journalism Inside Memory and Memory Studies', *Memory Studies* 1 (3): 311–20.
- Levy, D. and Sznaider, N. (2002). 'Memory Unbound: the Holocaust and the Formation of Cosmopolitan Memory', *European Journal of Social Theory* 5: 87–106.
- Levy, D. and Sznaider, N. (2006). *The Holocaust and Memory in the Global Age*. Philadelphia: Temple University Press.
- Liebes, T. (1999). 'The Structure of Broadcasting as the Structure of Society', *Kesher* 25: 88–97 (in Hebrew).
- Liebman, C. S. and Don-Yehiya, E. (1983). *Civil Religion in Israel: Traditional Judaism and Political Culture in the Jewish State*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Loshitzky, Y. (1997). 'Introduction'. In Y. Loshitzky (ed.), *Spielberg's Holocaust: Critical Perspectives on Schindler's List*. Bloomington, IN: Indiana University Press, 1–14.
- Meyers, O., Neiger, M., and Zandberg, E. (Forthcoming, 2011). 'Structuring the Sacred: Media Professionalism and the Production of Mediated Holocaust Memory'. *Communication Review* 14 (3).
- Meyers, O. and Zandberg, E. (2002). 'The Soundtrack of Memory: Ashes and Dust and Holocaust Commemoration in Israeli Popular Culture', *Media, Culture & Society* 24: 389–408.
- Meyers, O., Zandberg, E., and Neiger, M. (2009). 'Prime Time Commemoration: an Analysis of Television Broadcasts on Israel's Memorial Day for the Holocaust and the Heroism', *Journal of Communication* 59: 456–80.
- Neiger, M. (1999). 'The Israeli Literary Supplements and the Shaping of Israeli Culture: the Literary Supplements in the Israeli Press, 1948–1995, as a Creator of Changes and as a Reflector of Phenomena in Israeli Culture, Society, Press and Literature'. PhD dissertation submitted to the Department of Communication and Journalism, the Hebrew University of Jerusalem (in Hebrew).

- Neiger, M., Meyers, O., and Zandberg, E. (Forthcoming, 2011). 'Tuned to the Nation's Mood: Popular Music as a Mnemonic Cultural Object', *Media, Culture & Society*.
- Ofer, D. (1996) 'Israel'. In D. S. Wyman (ed.), *The World Reacts to the Holocaust*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 836–923.
- Pansler, J. D. (2004). 'Transmitting Jewish Culture: Radio in Israel', *Jewish Social Studies* 10 (1): 1–29.
- Regev, M. and Seroussi, E. (2004). *Popular Music and National Culture in Israel*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Romi S. and Lev, M. (2007). 'Experiential Learning of History Through Youth Journeys to Poland: Israeli Jewish Youth and the Holocaust', *Research in Education* 78 (1): 88–102.
- Segev, T. (1993). *The Seventh Million: the Israelis and the Holocaust*. New York: Hill and Wang.
- Shalita, H. (2010). 'You can't broadcast to the Northern neighborhoods alone, the state of Tel-Aviv had developed', *Globes*. See <http://www.globes.co.il/news/article.aspx?did=1000528386> (accessed May 2010).
- Shandler, J. (1999). *While America Watches: Televising the Holocaust*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Vinitzky-Seroussi, V. (1998). 'Jerusalem Assassinated Rabin and Tel Aviv Commemorated Him: Rabin Memorials and the Discourse of National Identity in Israel', *City and Society* 10 (1): 183–203.
- Zandberg, E. (2006). 'Critical Laughter: Humor, Popular Culture and Israeli Holocaust Commemoration', *Media, Culture & Society* 28 (4): 561–79.
- Zandberg, E. (2008). 'Between Destruction and Victory: Holocaust Memory in Israeli Press 1948–2000'. In M. Neiger, M. Blondheim, and T. Leibes (eds.), *Coverage as Storytelling: Reflections on Media Discourse*. Jerusalem: The Hebrew University, Magnes Press, and Smart Institute of Communication (in Hebrew), 191–215.
- Zandberg, E. (2010). 'The Right to Tell the (Right) Story: Journalism, Authority and Memory', *Media, Culture & Society* 32 (1): 5–24.
- Zandberg, E., Neiger, M., and Meyers, O. (2010) 'TV News, Representation, and Commemoration'. Paper presented at 'Representation Now: the Sum of it All' conference, Saint Louis University, Madrid Campus, April.
- Zerubavel, Y. (1995). *Recovered Roots: Collective Memory and the Making of Israeli National Tradition*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Zuckerman, M. (1993). *Shoah in the Sealed Room: the 'Holocaust' in Israeli Press During the Gulf War*. Tel Aviv: Author's Publication (in Hebrew).